

CHAPTER 2

THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

2.1 The Definition of Translation

According to Newmark (1988:5), translation is an action of transforming a text's meaning from a source language to another language while keeping the meaning expressed by the original writer. While the text is being transformed linguistically, the translator's main responsibility is to preserve the original meaning or intention of the author. This suggests that translation is not just about converting words but also about conveying the same ideas, nuances, and messages that were expressed in the original text, ensuring fidelity to the Author's intent while adapting it to a new linguistic and cultural context.

A further viewpoint of translation is presented by Larson, cited in Mannahali (2015:19), translation is the process of transferring content through a semantic form from the originally spoken language to the target language while preserving meaning, in spite of the form change. The translation focuses on meaning, rather than directly copying word-for-word structures. The crucial part is that while the form (grammar, sentence structure, or vocabulary) may change in translation to suit the target language, the meaning must remain consistent with the original. This suggests that translators prioritize preserving the core ideas, intent, and significance of the original text, even if they need to adapt the way it is expressed to fit the norms and style of the target language.

Meanwhile, Catford, as cited by Al-Sulaimaan and Khoshaba (2018:762), states that translation is the process of substituting linguistic units. Translation is viewed as the systematic substitution of words, phrases, or grammatical structures between two languages. The goal is to retain meaning while adapting the original language's elements to conform to the rules and context of the target language. Essentially, it points out the technical-linguistic feature of translation as a structured process of equivalence.

Based on the definition of translation above, I can conclude that the translation theories pay attention not only to the language but also to the concept of translation. All these theories stress on the fact that translation is not simply changing of words by other

words in the text, rather very careful and artful processes within which the meaning, ideas and purposes are retained despite the differences in language.

2.2 Subtitling

2.2.1 Definition

According to Gottlieb (1992:163), subtitling is a transcription of spoken conversation from a TV show or movie, usually with some condensing and display of the text as captions that run underneath the matching spoken words on the display. This process captures the essence of spoken words while focusing on key ideas, often leaving out less important elements like filler words or repetitive phrases to enhance clarity and readability. Subtitles at the bottom of the display are synchronized with the corresponding spoken dialogue, enabling viewers to read along without losing track of the action. The aim is to accurately convey the original meaning and context of the dialogue while adapting phrases for better readability, ensuring that the subtitled content is accessible and engaging for audiences across various languages.

In a related topic, according to Carroll and Ivarsson (1998:12), subtitling is a method used to translate spoken dialogue in audiovisual media by displaying text on the screen. This text acts as a written representation of the dialogue, enabling viewers to read what is being said while still engaging with the visual elements of the program. The main objective of subtitling is to preserve the original meaning, tone, and context of the spoken words while exceeding certain requirements, such as readability, time, and space restrictions. This definition highlights the dual role of subtitling as both a translation process and a visual communication tool, enhancing the accessibility of audiovisual content for a wide range of audiences.

From the two definitions above I can conclude that both provide comprehensive definitions of subtitling that emphasize its essential role in translating spoken dialogue within audiovisual media. They highlight that subtitling involves the transcription of spoken words into written text which is displayed as captions synchronized with the original audio. This process focuses on capturing the essence, meaning, tone, and context of the dialogue while condensing information for clarity and readability. Both definitions acknowledge the constraints of subtitling, such as timing and space limitations which necessitate the careful

selection of key ideas and the omission of less critical elements. Ultimately, subtitling serves as a vital translation method and visual communication tool, enhancing the accessibility and engagement of audiovisual content for diverse audiences across different languages and cultures.

2.2.2 General Concept of Subtitling

Carroll and Ivarsson (1998) as cited in Aisyah and Budiman (2020:799) emphasize the technical and practical concept of audiovisual translation subtitling. Their approach is based on three main concepts:

a. Condensation

Condensation is a core element of their theory which involves reducing the original dialogue to a shorter form while preserving the essential meaning. Subtitles displayed on screen should not last more than one second and, without music, should not last longer than seven seconds. Given the limited time viewers have to read subtitles and follow the visual elements, subtitlers must condense information while keeping the main message intact.

b. Simplification

Simplification means there can be no more than two subtitle lines at a time. This involves simplifying complex or lengthy sentences, removing redundant information, and avoiding over-complicated structures. The goal is to ensure that subtitles are easily understood by viewers in a limited amount of time.

c. Synchronization

In order to prevent interfering with the movie's visuals, the first line of a two-line subtitle should be shorter than the second. Synchronization is crucial in ensuring that subtitles appear on screen at the right time, matching the dialogue and visual actions. Carroll and Ivarsson emphasize that subtitles should appear and disappear in sync with the spoken language and the on-screen actions, without lingering too long or cutting off too early.

2.2.3 Kinds of Subtitling Strategy by Gottlieb

Gottlieb (1992:167) states proposed ten different subtitling strategies that can be used to effectively translate spoken dialogue in audiovisual media. These strategies tackle the

challenges of subtitling, including space limitations, cultural differences, and the necessity for linguistic precision. Below is a detailed list of these ten subtitling strategies.

a. Expansion

According to Gottlieb, as cited by Anisia and Agus (2023:114), expansion is a strategy used when the translation requires additional explanation due to some cultural nuance. For example:

SL (English): “The papa, he was a musician.”

TL (Indonesian language): “Papa-ku, dia seorang *Musikus*”

Referring to the example, the phrase “The Papa” can be translated as “Papa” in the target language. The translator adds the word “*ku*” after the word “*Papa*” so that it becomes “*Papa-ku*” in the target language to provide information about the storyline of the movie so the audience will not be confused with the movie.

b. Paraphrase

According to Gottlieb, as cited by Anisia and Agus (2023:114), the paraphrase is used when the translator uses different syntactical rules or changes the structure of the translation so the audience can easily understand. For example:

SL (English): “My boy, with a talent like yours, how could I not listen?”

TL (Indonesian language): “*Nak, dengan Bakat sepertimu, mengapa aku harus menolaknya?*”

The translator changes the structure or uses a different syntactical rule in the sentence “How could I not listen” which is translated as “*kenapa aku harus menolaknya*”. While, structurally like as translated word-for-word from a dictionary, the sentence should be translated as “*bagaimana mungkin aku tidak mendengarkan*”, yet the translator chooses to translate with paraphrasing strategy so that the translation is easier to understand and more suitable for the scene and dialog in the movie.

c. Transfer

According to Gottlieb, as cited by cited by Anisia and Agus (2023:114-115), the transfer is translating the translation literally without any additions, reductions, or transformations in the translation. The translator translates the text word for word so that the translation is structurally the same as well.

Transfer also is often seen in contexts where accuracy and fidelity to the original text are paramount, such as in legal or technical documents, where even the smallest change could alter the meaning. For example:

SL (English): I'm gonna play in the plaza, just like you did!

TL (Indonesian language): *Aku akan bermain di plaza, seperti yang kau lakukan!*

In the translation above, the appropriate strategy to apply is transfer, because the sentence "I'm gonna play in the plaza, just like you did!" from the source language is translated "*Aku akan bermain di plaza, seperti yang kau lakukan!*" into the target language.

d. Imitation

According to Gottlieb, as cited by Anisia and Agus (2023:115), imitation is a strategy that is usually used in texts that contain names of people and place names, while still using the same form. The essence of this strategy lies in preserving the original form of these names, rather than altering or translating them into a different language or cultural context. This approach is used to maintain the authenticity of the text, ensuring that the reader can recognize the specific individuals or locations referenced. For example:

SL (English): Look, it's Frida!

TL (Indonesian language): *Lihat, itu Frida!*

From the source language "Look, it's Frida!" is translated as "*Lihat, itu Frida!*" into the target language. As can be seen, the translator retains the word "Frida" because it is a character's name that should be retained and cannot be changed

e. Transcription

According to Gottlieb, as cited by Anisia and Agus (2023:115), transcription is a strategy that is employed in situations where the translator discovers unusual terms in the original text, like the use of nonsense language or a third language. For example:

SL (English): Then we are going to her! Vemonos!

TL (Indonesian language): *Maka kita yang mendatangnya! Cepatlah!*

The appropriate strategy for the translated text above is Transcription. From the source language, "Then we are going to her! Vemonos!" is translated as "*Maka kita yang mendatangnya! Cepatlah!*" into the target language. For example, the use of a third

language, which can be seen in the translation text, namely in the word “Vemonos!” which is translated into “*Cepatlah!*” into the target language.

f. Dislocation

According to Gottlieb, as cited by Anisia and Agus (2023:115), dislocation is a strategy where the subtitles contain some special effects, such as silly songs where the movie effect is far more important than the information. For example:

SL (English): ♪ FOR THIS MUSIC IS MY LANGUAGE AND THE WORLD ES MI FAMILIA ♪

TL (Indonesian language): ♪ KARENA MUSIK INI ADALAH BAHASAKU DAN DUNIA INI KELUARGAKU ♪

In this translation, above is a song from the movie COCO.

g. Condensation

According to Gottlieb (1992), as cited by Anisia and Agus (2023:114), condensation is a strategy that used to condense unnecessary utterances, but it does not lose the message. For example:

SL (English): You’ll feel better after you eat with your family.

TL (Indonesian language): *Kau akan merasa lebih baik setelah makan bersama keluargamu.*

The translated text above belongs to condensation, from the source language “You’ll feel better after you eat with your family.” is translated into “*Kau akan merasa lebih baik setelah makan bersama keluargamu.*” into the target language. There is a word that is omitted, namely the word “you” because even though the word is omitted, it does not change the message or meaning conveyed through the translation.

h. Decimation

According to Gottlieb, as cited by Anisia and Agus (2023:114), decimation is a translation strategy that is used when the scene is so fast-paced and limited in duration that there is not enough time to translate it and the translator chooses to remove some words. For example:

SL (English): *You will listen to your family.* No more music.

TL (Indonesian language): *Dengarkanlah Keluargamu. Jangan ada musik.*

The translation strategy for the translated text above is decimation. As can be seen from the source language “You will listen to your family. No more music.” which is translated into the target language into “*Dengarkanlah Keluargamu. Jangan ada musik*”. If translated accurately, the correct translation would be “*Kamu akan mendengarkan keluargamu. Tidak ada lagi musik*”. Gottlieb (1992:166), states that the decimation strategy is used when there is a scene with a duration that is too fast, And the translator applied it to this translation, the translator did total elimination due to the limited duration of the scene.

i. Deletion

According to Gottlieb, as cited by Anisia and Agus (2023:114), deletion is a translation strategy that does total elimination in the target language applied to question tags, filler words, and repetition words. For example:

SL (English): I’m Miguel, your great-great-grandson...

TL (Indonesian language): *Aku Miguel. Cucumu*

The translator applied the deletion strategy to his translation. He removed the repetition words from the source language “I’m Miguel, your great-great grandson...” to “*Aku Miguel. Cucumu*” into the target language. The translator removes the repetition words in “great-great grandson” which should be translated as “*Cucu buyut mu*”.

j. Resignation

According to Gottlieb, as cited by Anisia and Agus (2023:114), resignation is a translation strategy used when a translator is unable to come up with a solution. For example:

SL (English): Ha ha!

TL (Indonesian language): -

The translator did not translate the word “Ha ha” from the source language into the target language because the sound of the movie was quite small and the word was already illustrated nor did it lose any meaning in the other translations.

2.3 Movie

2.3.1 Definition

According to Bordwell and Thompson (2004:9), a movie is a collection of still images displayed in rapid succession on a screen to create the illusion of motion. These

images are combined with sounds, such as dialogue, music, and sound effects, as well as the editing process, which arranges the footage to tell a cohesive story. Through visual storytelling, movies convey narratives or represent abstract concepts, using this blend of motion, sound, and editing to engage the audience and express ideas beyond just the visuals.

While Hornby (2006:950) defines a movie as a sequence of moving pictures with audio that is projected in a theater that conveys a story. It highlights two essential components: the visual element of moving images and the auditory element of sound, which together create a cinematic experience. Hornby also emphasizes the traditional setting of a movie, being shown in a theater, and underscores that the central aim of this medium is to tell a story, whether fictional or based on real-life events.

Another perspective, according to Summers (1992: 476), a roll of light-sensitive material used in cameras to produce still or moving images for a movie theater is called a movie. A fictionalized story or narrative that is filmed and shown on television or in movie theaters. The technical process involved in filmmaking focuses on how movies are traditionally created using physical film stock to record visual content. In addition to the technical aspect, Summers also emphasizes the narrative function of movies, noting that they often involve fictionalized stories or narratives that are filmed and subsequently shown either in movie theaters or on television. This highlights the dual nature of movies as both a technical process of capturing visuals and an artistic medium for storytelling, whether it's for cinematic projection or home viewing.

From the description above, I can conclude that the definitions of a movie provided by Bordwell and Thompson (2004), Hornby (2006), and Summer (1992), each emphasizes different aspects of filmmaking. They collectively highlight the multidimensional nature of the medium. Bordwell and Thompson focus on the integration of visuals, sound, and editing to create a cohesive story or abstract representation, highlighting the artistic and expressive side of movies. Hornby complements this by emphasizing the cinematic experience as a combination of moving pictures and sound, traditionally experienced in a theater, with the primary purpose of storytelling. Summer, on the other hand, brings attention to the technical process of filmmaking, referencing the physical film stock used to capture motion, while also acknowledging the importance of narrative in both cinema and television.

Together, these perspectives offer a comprehensive understanding of what constitutes a movie, combining its technical foundation with its function as a powerful storytelling medium. These definitions of a movie provide a solid foundation for understanding its core components, from the technical aspects to the art of storytelling. With this understanding in place, it's important to explore the various kinds of movies that exist, as films can be categorized into different genres and types based on their content, style, and purpose. By examining the different kinds of movies, we can further appreciate the diversity and richness of cinematic expression.

2.3.2 Movie Subtitling

Movie subtitling is the translation of spoken language into text put on the screen. It entails attention to timing and synchrony as well as cultural context so that a viewer keeps track of the plot without missing important dialogues.

Khalaf (2016:122) states that one variety of translation that is truly in demand within the context of the audiovisual industry indeed includes subtitling which encompasses dubbing, voice-over, and audio description. Put differently, the audiovisual language of TV shows and movies can be translated in some ways with the aim of allowing target audiences to understand it when they are unfamiliar with the source language.

Here's the revised paragraph with "subtitles" replaced by "subtitling" where appropriate: Cintas and Remael, as cited in Khalaf (2016:123), identify two types of subtitling. The first classification is based on time, distinguishing between pre-prepared subtitling, offline subtitling, and live or online subtitling. Pre-prepared subtitling is edited and finalized before the program's broadcast, while live subtitling is created in real-time, often by professional interpreters such as stenographers or through speech recognition software. The second classification is based on technical parameters, dividing subtitling into open and closed types. Open subtitling is permanently embedded in the video image, whereas closed subtitling can be turned on or off depending on the viewer's preference, making it more flexible and accessible.

According to Gottlieb (1992:163), subtitling involves the transcription of spoken dialogue from television shows or films into written text, which is then displayed as captions on the screen. Usually, these subtitles appear at the bottom of the screen. and are

synchronized with the spoken words, allowing the audience to follow the dialogue in written form while watching the visual content. This process often involves condensing the original speech, as subtitles must fit within limited screen space and be readable within the short time they appear, all while maintaining the essence of the conversation.

From the paragraphs above I can conclude that in the audiovisual industry, subtitling is an essential translation technique that helps viewers who are not fluent in the source language comprehend movies and TV series. dialogue is translated into written text in this procedure, which is then shown on screen in sync with the images.

2.4 Previous Related Studies

Many previous researches about subtitling strategies involve the study of different movies. Three research is present in this section, all of which share a similar technique. However, each study is unique, as is the subject matter that each researcher selects. These earlier studies are relevant to my research, thus I rely on them as references.

The first research was done by Irwan et al.(2021) in their journal titled *Translation Strategy of Indonesian Subtitle for English Taboo Words in The Get Hard Movie: Gottlieb's Strategy*. The study aims to explore the new translation techniques applied to the film's English taboo texts in Indonesian subtitles of a *Get Hard*. The study's focus is to identify the translation strategies applied to these taboo texts and evaluate how these strategies affect the overall translation quality. To achieve these objectives, the researcher employs an embedded design, utilizing a mixed-methods approach. This methodology incorporates Gottlieb's (1992) subtitling strategies through qualitative analysis, alongside House's Translation Quality Assessment, which uses quantitative methods to assess the effectiveness of the translations.

The research approach involves an examination of the subtitling strategies used in the film *Get Hard*. The researcher collects data from the subtitles, focusing specifically on the strategies used to translate taboo language. The sample population consists of various instances of translated text from the movie, with a total of 298 data points collected for analysis. Among these data points, the study identifies six emerging translation strategies, providing a comprehensive overview of how taboo content is approached in Indonesian subtitles. The results show that there are 128, or 43%, were mostly in paraphrasing strategy.

The Transfer Strategy 73 (25%), Condensation Strategy 76 (26%), Imitation Strategy 12 (4%), Dislocation Strategy 3 (1%), and Transcription Strategy 2 (1%).

The second research was conducted by Fitri & Noverino, (2023) in their journal, titled *Subtitling Strategies of imperative sentences from English into Indonesian in the Divergent Series: Insurgent Movie*. Their study focuses on the subtitling strategies applied to imperative sentences in the movie *The Divergent Series: Insurgent*. The study aims to identify and analyze the different subtitling strategies employed. To achieve this, the researcher utilizes a descriptive method, allowing for a comprehensive examination of the translation processes. The English and Indonesian subtitles serve as the research's source data from *The Divergent Series: Insurgent*, with the dialogue in the movie serving as the main focus. The theoretical framework applied in this study is based on Gottlieb's (1992) subtitling strategies.

The results show there are 73 occurrences of the paraphrase strategy or almost 42% of the total data, making it the most frequently used. 32 (19%) of the Transfer strategy, 21 (12%) of the Imitation strategy, 13 (8%) of the Expansion strategy, 4 (2%) of the Condensation strategy, 5 (3%) of the Decimation strategy, 12 (7%) of Deletion strategy, and 5 (3%) of Resignation strategy.

The third research was conducted by Kholiq and Agustinne (2020) in their journal titled *Subtitling Strategies in "The Boss Baby: Back in Business" Series*. the goal of their study is to determine and examine the translation techniques used in the Netflix series *The Boss Baby: Back in Business*. The study utilizes a descriptive qualitative method, where data is collected in the form of words rather than numbers, allowing for an in-depth exploration of the translation strategies. The analysis focuses on the subtitling of the series, using Gottlieb's (1992) theory of translation strategies as the theoretical framework. This approach helps to determine how different translation strategies are applied to the subtitles in this web television series.

The data reveals that six translation strategies are employed in the subtitles of *The Boss Baby: Back in Business*. These strategies include the transfer strategy, decimation strategy, deletion strategy, paraphrase strategy, imitation strategy, and transcription strategy. A total of 34 data points were identified in the research. The study categorizes these

strategies to assess their frequency and impact on the translation. The data collected provides insights into how the different strategies are applied in conveying the meaning of the original English dialogue into the Indonesian subtitles. According to the findings, the most often used subtitling strategy in the series is the 17 condensation strategy (50%). This is followed by 7 (20%) deletion strategy, 3 (10%) paraphrase strategy, 3 (10%) transfer strategy, 3 (10%) transcription strategy.

From the three previous studies above, I concluded that there are several similarities and differences in their approaches to analyzing translation strategies. All three studies use Gottlieb's (1992) theory of subtitling strategies as a descriptive qualitative method to collect and analyze data. However, each study focuses on different types of content: Irwan, et. al (2021) focused on the subtitling strategies for taboo texts in *Get Hard*, while Noverino and Ade Fitri (2023) focused on the subtitling strategies for imperative sentences in *The Divergent Series: Insurgent*, and Kholiq and Agustinne (2020) analyzed translation strategies in the animated series *The Boss Baby: Back in Business*. My research focuses on analyzing informal language, slang, and humor that reflect the cultural norms of the 1960s era in the 2019 movie script called *Once Upon a Time in Hollywood*.